



Key Health Care/Privacy Votes - Minnesota Senate 2005
Amendments to Senate Health and Human Services (HHS) Omnibus Bill

Key:

Y = Voted Yes
N = Voted No
O = Did not vote

- (A) **Stop Big Government Health Data System:** The amendment offered by Sen. Julianne Ortman (R-Chanhassen) to delete the section authorizing MN's Health Commissioner to work "with local public health departments to develop a public health information network" that is "consistent with the recommendations, goals, and strategies of the Minnesota public health information network report to the 2005 legislature and the e-health initiative." Senate Chamber debate, May 4, 2005. Sen. Ortman called the proposal controversial and in need of a public discussion. **Failed** 25-38. *Y = Pro-Privacy Vote.*
- (B) **Protect Patient Consent in Minnesota:** The amendment offered by Sen. Warren Limmer (R-Maple Grove), to require state agencies to follow Minnesota's strong medical privacy and patient consent law. The bill allows government to follow *both* the strong privacy-protecting Minnesota law and the so-called federal "medical privacy" rule (HIPAA), which *allows extensive sharing and disclosure* of private medical data without patient consent. May 4, 2005. Senator Limmer noted the "contradiction in standards" between state and federal law and expressed concern that government agencies could get "wiggleroom" to bypass the strong MN law. **Failed** 32-33. *Y = Pro-Privacy Vote.*
- (C) **Legalize Government-Imposed Cookbook Medicine:** The amendment offered by Sen. Sheila Kiscaden (I-Rochester) to make permanent the controversial 2004 "cookbook medicine" law. In 2004, the state legislature passed a bill requiring government to determine "best practices" in medicine. Physician adherence to these treatment protocols must be tracked and publicly reported—and doctors can be financially penalized for poor compliance. A 2006 expiration date was added after Minnesota citizens delivered a 12-inch high stack of petitions to the Governor opposing the legislation.
- This amendment *deleted the expiration date*, added new language, and changed all "best practice guidelines" references to "evidence-based health care guidelines." Senate Chamber debate, May 4, 2005. Sen. Ortman opposed the amendment, calling it "very controversial." Sen. Kiscaden said "Controversy is in the eyes of the beholder," noting that Governor Pawlenty started the "Smart Buy Alliance" to purchase health care based on quality, which Kiscaden claimed must be measured through use of guidelines. **Passed** 39-28. *N = Pro-Patient Vote.*
- (D) **Limit Taxpayer-Financed Government Health Care:** The amendment offered by Sen. Brian LeClair (R-Woodbury) to delete the "MinnesotaCare Option for Small Employers" section of the bill. Senate Chamber debate, May 4, 2005. He advocated for Health Savings Accounts instead. **Failed** 29-35. *Y = Private Insurance/Free-Market Vote*

Amendment:		(A) Stop Big Government Health Data System	(B) Protect Medical Privacy and Patient Consent in Minnesota	(C) Legalize Government- Imposed Cookbook Medicine <i>(Kiscaden-IP)</i>	(D) Limit Taxpayer- Financed Government Health Care <i>(LeClair-R)</i>
Amendment Author:		<i>(Ortman-R)</i>	<i>(Limmer-R)</i>	<i>(Kiscaden-IP)</i>	<i>(LeClair-R)</i>
District	Senator/Party	25-38 Failed	32-33 Failed	39-28 Passed	29-35 Failed
66	Anderson, Ellen (D)	N	N	Y	N
52	Bachmann, Michele (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
6	Bakk, Thomas (D)	N	N	Y	Y
40	Belanger, William (R)	O	Y	N	Y
61	Berglin, Linda (D)	Y	N	Y	N
51	Betzold, Don (D)	N	N	Y	N
50	Chaudhary, Satveer (D)	N	N	Y	N
64	Cohen Richard (D)	N	N	Y	N
26	Day, Dick (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
60	Dibble, D. Scott (D)	N	N	Y	N
18	Dille, Steve (R)	N	Y	Y	O
14	Fischbach, Michelle (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
47	Foley, Leo (D)	N	Y	Y	N
21	Frederickson, Dennis (R)	N	Y	Y	N
43	Gaither, David (R)	O	Y	N	Y
37	Gerlach, Chris (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
42	Hann, David (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
58	Higgins, Linda (D)	N	N	Y	N
23	Hottinger, John (D)	N	N	Y	N
13	Johnson, Dean (D)	N	N	Y	Y
49	Johnson, Debbie (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
48	Jungbauer, Michael (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
44	Kelley, Steve (D)	N	N	Y	N
31	Kierlin, Bob (R)	Y	Y	Y	Y
30	Kiscaden, Sheila (IP)	N	N	Y	Y
15	Kleis, Dave (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
12	Koering, Paul (R)	N	N	N	N
20	Kubly, Gary (D)	N	Y	Y	N
9	Langseth, Keith (D)	N	Y	Y	N
10	Larson, Cal (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
56	LeClair, Brian (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
32	Limmer, Warren (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
8	Lourey, Becky (D)	N	N	Y	N
57	Marko, Sharon (D)	N	N	Y	N
54	Marty, John (D)	N	N	Y	N
38	McGinn, Mike (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
39	Metzen, James (D)	N	N	Y	N
41	Michel, Geoff (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
67	Moua, Mee (D)	N	N	Y	N
28	Murphy, Steve (D)	Y	N	Y	N
25	Neuville, Thomas (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
17	Nienow, Sean (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
33	Olson, Gen (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
34	Ortman, Julianne (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
19	Ourada, Mark (R)	O	Y	N	O
65	Pappas, Sandra (D)	N	N	Y	N
36	Pariseau, Pat (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
59	Pogemiller, Lawrence (D)	N	N	Y	N
63	Ranum, Jane (D)	N	N	Y	N
53	Reiter, Mady (R)	O	O	N	Y
45	Rest, Ann (D)	N	N	Y	N
35	Robling, Claire (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
24	Rosen, Julie (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
4	Ruud, Carrie (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
11	Sams, Dallas (D)	N	N	Y	N
3	Saxhaug, Tom (D)	N	N	Y	N
46	Scheid, Linda (D)	N	O	Y	O
29	Senjem, David (R)	N	Y	N	Y
2	Skoe, Rod (D)	N	N	Y	N
62	Skoglund, Wesley (D)	N	N	Y	N
7	Solon, Yvonne Prettner (D)	N	N	Y	N
27	Sparks, Dan (D)	N	N	Y	N
1	Stumpf, LeRoy (D)	N	N	Y	N
5	Tomassoni, David (D)	N	N	Y	N
22	Vickerman, Jim (D)	N	N	Y	N
16	Wergin, Betsy (R)	Y	Y	N	Y
55	Wiger, Charles (D)	N	N	Y	N